



NATIONAL BANK OF UKRAINE

**Corporate Cash Holdings and Trade Credit:
Does Financial/Price (In)Stability Matter?**

Andriy Tsapin

Kyiv, May 19, 2017



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Outline

- Motivation/Literature/Contribution/Preview of findings
- Empirical Strategy
- Results Discussion
- Conclusions



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Motivation

- The collapse of bank lending and heightened uncertainty in post-crisis period resulted in a significant increase in corporate cash reserves for precautionary motive (Bigelli & Sanchez-Vidal, 2012).
- Bank lending was sluggish and banks accumulated significant liquidity reserves (NBU, 2017)
- Credit crunch that affects financial lenders also affects non-financial lenders who provide informal financing (Love et al., 2007).
- Trade credit implies a certain risk and, therefore, is secured by precautionary cash holdings (Wu, Rui & Wu, 2012).
- Changes in macroeconomic stability trigger adjustments in firms' cash holdings (Baum et al., 2006)



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Literature

Why Do Firms Hold Cash?

Information asymmetries, transaction and agency costs affect firm decision on cash savings.

- **Trade-off:** Hoarding cash can be a response to adverse shocks and potential financial constraints (Miller & Orr, 1966). Opportunity costs of the capital invested in cash make these holdings less attractive.
- **Pecking order:** rejects target level of cash. Firms finance themselves in hierarchical fashion according to the relative costs of different sources of funds (Myers Majluf, 1984). Cash is considered as “negative debt”.
- **Agency cost:** Entrenched managers prefer retaining cash to paying it out as dividends (Jensen, 1986).



Why do firms employ trade credit?

- to ensure informal financing as a source of reserve liquidity (Love et al., 2007, Cunat, 2007)
- to advance their growth (Ferrando & Mulier, 2013).
- to enhance their sales and consequently hold less inventories (Bougheas et al., 2009).
- to discriminate customers on price basis and strengthen own competitive position on the market (Meltzer, 1960).



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Contribution

This study provides evidence of micro-level channel through which price volatility influences cash management.

In particular, it...

- examines on how trade credit affects cash under uncertainty
- explores asymmetric influence of credit payables and credit receivables
- looks into impact of financial cycle and immobilisation



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Cash Holdings and Trade Credit Under Price Instability

Trade receivables should be negatively associated with cash because they may serve as

- Cash substitute
- Collateral for bank loan

Trade payables should be positively associated with cash because they require cash

- to ensure repayment of obligations
- to get cash discounts
- to avoid undesirable late payment penalties and a possible impairment in credit rating

Price Volatility

- increases the cost of converting receivables into cash
- hinders firms from accurate prediction of relative prices and hence their financial flows
- restricts lenders in credit risk and transaction costs assessment



Regression Model and Method

- Regression model:

$$Cash/NA_{it} = \beta_1 Volatility_t + \beta_2 Rcv/NA_{it} + \beta_3 Pay/NA_{it}$$

$$+ \beta_4 Rcv/NA_{it} \times Volatility_t + \beta_5 Pay/NA_{it} \times Volatility_t$$

$$+ \sum \beta_j Controls_{it} + \mu_i + \lambda_i + \tau_t + \epsilon_{it}$$

$$\beta_1 > 0,$$

$$\beta_2 < 0, \beta_4 > 0$$

$$\beta_3 > 0, \beta_5 < 0$$

- Subsamples: Financial Constraints, Financial Cycle, Financial Immobilisation
- Panel estimator with within-groups transformations (OLS FE)
- Robustness check: OLS RE, 2SLS



Data

- Our dataset comes from the National Securities and Stock Market Commission (SMIDA database), the State Statistics Service of Ukraine, and the National bank of Ukraine.
- Screened: we exclude financial firms and firms with negative sales.
- Year-end Ukrainian consumer-price index is used to deflate the variables to 2003 UAH.
- Winsorized at the most extreme (top and bottom) one percent level of the distribution
- After the screening, our sample size consists of over 140,000 firm-year observations pertaining to about 20,000 firms.
- The data cover the period between 2003 to 2015.



Identification of Price Instability

- A survey-based proxy derived from the dispersion of forecasts (Schmukler et al., 1999)
- A measure obtained from moving standard deviations of the macroeconomic series (Ghosal and Loungani, 2000)
- Merton's measure of risk defined as the squared first difference of the daily changes in series, divided by the square root of the number of operating days (Merton, 1980; Caglayan et al., 2010)
- An ARCH/ GARCH model to proxy for price instability (Beaudry et al., 2001; Baum et al., 2008)



Identification of Price Instability

- The generalized ARCH (GARCH(1,1)) model is run for monthly consumer price index (CPI) and monetary aggregate M3 series where the mean equation is an autoregression over 2003-2015. The conditional variances derived from this GARCH processes are aggregated to annual frequency.

	(CPI)	(M3)
	1	2
Constant	-0.0065***	-0.1842***
AR(1)	0.2056**	0.4403***
ARCH(1)	0.5293***	0.6039***
GARCH(1)	0.5849***	0.7166***
Constant	0.0001**	-0.0007
N	184	184



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Descriptive Statistics for All Firms

Variables	Mean	Std	Min	Max
Cash/NA	0.041	0.079	0.000	0.723
RCV/NA	0.166	0.178	0.000	0.940
Pay/NA	0.207	0.227	0.000	0.968
NWC/NA	0.106	0.322	-2.379	0.917
NWC2/NA	0.154	0.298	-2.363	0.890
FCycle	0.819	0.755	-0.571	6.369
Immobil	0.147	0.332	-2.315	1.143
Size	11.044	1.528	6.957	16.207
Growth	1.094	0.512	0.004	6.378
CF/NA	0.320	0.335	-0.294	2.565
BC/TD	0.130	0.200	0.000	0.999
N	140,607			



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Descriptive Statistics: Small vs Large Firms

Variables	Small		Large	
	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.
Cash/NA	0.053	0.091	0.034	0.068
RCV/NA	0.155	0.176	0.178	0.179
Pay/NA	0.208	0.224	0.209	0.226
NWC/NA	0.099	0.332	0.089	0.306
NWC2/NA	0.152	0.314	0.123	0.289
FCycle	0.860	0.811	0.730	0.666
Immobil	0.150	0.345	0.123	0.316
Size	9.401	0.694	12.674	1.030
Growth	1.046	0.471	1.136	0.555
CF/NA	0.441	0.426	0.239	0.245
BC/TD	0.085	0.170	0.170	0.213
DM	0.091	0.197	0.197	0.264
N	40,949		47,161	



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Descriptive Statistics: Firms with vs without LTD

Variable	without LTD		with LTD	
	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.
Cash/NA	0.048	0.085	0.032	0.067
RCV/NA	0.178	0.188	0.150	0.161
Pay/NA	0.225	0.241	0.187	0.205
NWC/NA	0.092	0.326	0.126	0.312
NWC2/NA	0.141	0.306	0.165	0.288
FCycle	0.827	0.785	0.822	0.719
Immobil	0.138	0.340	0.159	0.321
Size	10.638	1.407	11.474	1.534
Growth	1.085	0.509	1.101	0.510
CF/NA	0.357	0.370	0.282	0.285
BC/TD	0.105	0.203	0.161	0.193
DM	0.000	0.000	0.305	0.268
N	70,138		66,169	



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Descriptive Statistics: Financial Cycle

Variable	FCycle>0		FCycle>0		FCycle<0		FCycle<0	
	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.
Cash/NA	0.058	0.095	0.024	0.050	0.047	0.089	0.023	0.053
RCV/NA	0.166	0.185	0.165	0.168	0.158	0.180	0.138	0.153
Pay/NA	0.187	0.225	0.206	0.211	0.362	0.280	0.373	0.259
NWC/NA	0.168	0.314	0.105	0.290	-0.301	0.242	-0.345	0.246
NWC2/NA	0.193	0.299	0.146	0.281	-0.106	0.276	-0.118	0.264
FCycle	0.934	0.807	0.843	0.654	-0.147	0.128	-0.141	0.121
Immobil	0.224	0.332	0.129	0.293	-0.252	0.254	-0.319	0.244
Size	10.691	1.464	11.401	1.488	10.681	1.632	11.268	1.671
Growth	1.080	0.513	1.105	0.498	1.094	0.583	1.096	0.544
CF/NA	0.350	0.373	0.301	0.285	0.252	0.358	0.250	0.325
BC/TD	0.000	0.000	0.270	0.214	0.000	0.000	0.145	0.143
DM	0.087	0.202	0.212	0.263	0.051	0.145	0.157	0.222
N	63,204		64,871		4,625		3,604	



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Descriptive Statistics: Immobilisation

Variable	Immobil>0		Immobil>0		Immobil<0		Immobil<0	
	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.	Mean	Std. Dev.
Cash/NA	0.066	0.102	0.026	0.054	0.029	0.058	0.019	0.042
RCV/NA	0.171	0.189	0.168	0.171	0.150	0.169	0.154	0.160
Pay/NA	0.155	0.199	0.169	0.185	0.329	0.274	0.306	0.244
NWC/NA	0.275	0.224	0.242	0.192	-0.270	0.252	-0.239	0.223
NWC2/NA	0.262	0.243	0.243	0.216	-0.092	0.323	-0.088	0.283
FCycle	1.008	0.821	0.957	0.666	0.414	0.665	0.460	0.558
Immobil	0.340	0.236	0.270	0.193	-0.241	0.248	-0.220	0.219
Size	10.676	1.454	11.396	1.454	10.735	1.540	11.392	1.584
Growth	1.083	0.493	1.111	0.474	1.072	0.584	1.093	0.551
CF/NA	0.365	0.370	0.304	0.274	0.277	0.373	0.288	0.312
BC/TD	0.000	0.000	0.272	0.208	0.000	0.000	0.247	0.222
DM	0.093	0.212	0.251	0.280	0.059	0.151	0.126	0.197
N	50,693		45,601		17,132		22,863	



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Results for All Firms

	Cash/NA				
	1	2	3	4	5
Volatility	0.0188***	0.0176***	0.0191***	0.0192***	0.0187***
Rcv/NA				-0.0317***	-0.0340***
Rcv/NA × Volatility					0.0446***
Pay/NA				0.0193***	0.0211***
Pay/NA × Volatility					-0.0414***
NWC1/NA	-0.0245***				
NWC2/NA		-0.0115***	-0.0199***	-0.0185***	-0.0185***
(NWC1-NWC2)/NA			-0.0332***		
Size	-0.0076***	-0.0088***	-0.0074***	-0.0073***	-0.0074***
Growth	0.0034***	0.0034***	0.0033***	0.0033***	0.0033***
CF/NA	0.0773***	0.0752***	0.0782***	0.0770***	0.0769***
BC/TD	-0.0170***	-0.0180***	-0.0145***	-0.0159***	-0.0156***
F			94.37***		
F (year)					57.35***
F (industry)					7.63***



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Results for All Firms: Robustness Check

	Cash/NA					
	RE (cpi)	RE (m3)	FE (cpi)	RE (m3)	2SLS FE(cpi)	2SLS FE(m3)
	1	2	3	4	5	6
Volatility	0.0291***	0.0157***	0.0187***	0.0114***	0.0187***	0.0108**
Rcv/NA	-0.0126***	-0.0132***	-0.0340***	-0.0343***	-0.1832***	-0.1843***
Rcv/NA*Volatility	0.0289*	0.0171*	0.0446***	0.0278***	0.3038***	0.1889***
Pay/NA	0.0044**	0.0046**	0.0211***	0.0212***	0.0555***	0.0565***
Pay/NA*Volatility	-0.0367***	-0.0173**	-0.0414***	-0.0245***	-0.2803***	-0.1705***
BC/TD	-0.0225***	-0.0236***	-0.0156***	-0.0156***	-0.0060**	-0.0059**
Hausman (χ^2)					288.099***	291.260***
Kleibergen-Paap rk LM					2164.784***	2168.954***
Hansen's J					0.211	0.200
Root MSE					0.057	0.057
R ²	0.114	0.113	0.084	0.084		
N	136,307	136,307	136,307	136,307	126,917	126,917



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Results for Subsamples: Impact of Financial Constraints

	Cash/NA			
	small	large	low DM	high DM
	1	2	3	4
Volatility	0.0269***	0.0135*	0.0232***	0.0177***
NWC2/TA	-0.0315***	-0.0181***	-0.0334***	-0.0140***
Rcv/NA	-0.0692***	-0.0225***	-0.0551***	-0.0211***
Rcv/NA*Volatility	0.1386***	-0.0112	0.0700***	0.0211
Pay/NA	0.0394***	0.0213***	0.0365***	0.0175***
Pay/NA*Volatility	-0.0897***	-0.0127	-0.0492**	-0.0495***
Size	-0.0094***	-0.0075***	-0.0084***	-0.0079***
Growth	0.0072***	0.0014*	0.0035***	0.0031***
CF/NA	0.0784***	0.0848***	0.0822***	0.0713***
BC/TD	-0.0253***	-0.0100***	-0.0195***	-0.0095***
R ²	0.114	0.064	0.096	0.071
N	40,949	47,161	70,138	66,169



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Results for Subsamples: Impact of Financial Cycle

	Cash/NA			
	fcycle>0	fcycle>0	fcycle<0	fcycle<0
	1	2	3	4
Volatility	0.0246***	-0.0017	-0.0362	0.0131
NWC2/TA	-0.0262***	-0.0190***	-0.0538***	-0.0350**
Rcv/NA	-0.0557***	-0.0200***	-0.023	-0.0246
Rcv/NA × Volatility	0.0724***	0.0195	0.2472	-0.0297
Pay/NA	0.0288***	0.0246***	0.0569***	0.0527***
Pay/NA × Volatility	-0.0559***	0.0006	-0.033	-0.0002
Size	-0.0126***	-0.0028***	-0.0145*	0.001
Growth	0.0041***	0.0024***	0.0029	0.0048*
CF/NA	0.0969***	0.0459***	0.0745***	0.0250***
BC/TD		0.0034		0.0339
R ²	0.111	0.043	0.137	0.096
N	63,204	64,871	4,628	3,604



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Results for Subsamples: Impact of Immobilisation

	Cash/NA			
	immobil>0	immobil>0	immobil<0	immobil<0
	1	2	3	4
Volatility	0.0270***	-0.0004	0.0060	-0.0070
NWC2/TA	-0.0824***	-0.0447***	-0.0475***	-0.0378***
Rcv/NA	-0.1059***	-0.0463***	-0.0666***	-0.0381***
Rcv/NA × Volatility	0.0754***	0.0110	0.0360	0.0170
Pay/NA	0.0761***	0.0438***	0.0598***	0.0474***
Pay/NA × Volatility	-0.0543*	0.0140	-0.0001	0.0070
Size	-0.0187***	-0.0050***	-0.002	-0.0001
Growth	0.0025**	0.0030***	0.0056***	0.0017**
CF/NA	0.1128***	0.0540***	0.0444***	0.0274***
BC/TD		0.0030		0.0050
R ²	0.138	0.056	0.103	0.064
N	50,693	45,601	17,132	22,863



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Conclusions

- Cash holdings increase as a firm encounters higher price volatility.
- Cash is sensitive to the joint impact of trade credit and price volatility.
- Asymmetric influence underlines the need to separate the effects of demand and supply sides of the trade credit.
- Firms extend risky trade credit to their customers under price uncertainty and it lends ground for accumulation of excessive liquidity, especially for financially constrained firms.
- Under uncertainty firms accept more certain informal financing.



NATIONAL
BANK OF
UKRAINE

Conclusions

- Price stability facilitates conversion of cash substitutes (trade receivables) into cash.
- Lower price volatility also increases the cost of trade payables and, thus, makes bank financing more attractive for the firms.

.

Avenues for future research:

- Effect of market competition
- Impact of switching costs